Joe Murphy Analytical Graphics, Inc. jmurphy@agi.com 610-457-5002



ITEA Conference - 2013

Leveraging M&S Tools for Rigorous Test Designs

Nov 12, 2013

DOD, AT&L, DTE, DOT&E Policy Directives

- Current mandates from offices of: DOT&E & DT&E/TRMC
 - Smarter Test Planning methods Scientific Test and Analysis Techniques (STAT)
 - **Design of Experiments**
 - Other M&S and Statistical based methods
 - DAG directed use of M&S in T&E
 - Initiatives to push OT and DT considerations to the beginning stages of systems requirements development
 - Initiatives to perform OT as early in the DT cycle as possible
 - TRMC initiative Identify high-payoff areas for potential savings



DoDI 5000.2

DoDI5000.2; Enclosure 5

- E5.1 The PM, in concert with the user and test and evaluation communities, shall coordinate developmental test and evaluation (DT&E), operational test and evaluation (OT&E), LFT&E, family-of-systems interoperability testing, information assurance testing, and modeling and simulation (M&S) activities, into an efficient continuum, closely integrated with requirements definition and systems design and development. The T&E strategy shall provide information about risk and risk mitigation, provide empirical data to validate models and simulations, evaluate technical performance and system maturity, and determine whether systems are operationally effective, suitable, and survivable against the threat detailed in the System Threat Assessment.
- Adequate time and resources shall be planned to support pre-test predictions and post-test reconciliation of models and test results, for all major test events.
- E5.3.1 Projects that undergo a Milestone A decision shall have a T&E strategy that shall primarily address M&S, including identifying and managing the associated risk, and that shall evaluate system concepts against mission requirements.
- E5.4.7 Appropriate use of accredited models and simulation shall support DT&E, IOT&E, and LFT&E.

DAG – Chap 9 – T&E

- From Defense Acquisition Guidebook Chapter 9 Test & Evaluation May 2010 For T&E, the appropriate application of M&S is an essential tool in achieving both an effective and
- efficient T&E program.
- T&E is conducted in a continuum of live, virtual, and constructive environments
- DoD Components have guidelines for use of M&S in acquisition, especially T&E. These guidelines are intended to supplement other such resources.
- are interview to support that other sources to the sources. The program manager should have an M&S subgroup to the T&E Working-level Integrated Product Team (T&E WIPT) that develops the program's M&S strategy that should be documented in the program's Systems Engineering Plan and the Test and Evaluation Strategy Test and Evaluation Master Plan. Some DoD components require planning for M&S to be documented in a separate M&S Support Plan
- This M&S strategy will be the basis for program investments in M&S.
- M&S should be planned for utility across the program's life cycle, modified and updated as required to ensure utility as well as applicability to all increments of an evolutionary acquisition strategy. A program's T&E strategy should leverage the advantages of M&S.
- M&S planning should address which of many possible uses of M&S the program plans to execute in support of T&E.
- Models and simulations can be used in planning to identify high-payoff areas in which to apply
- Rehearsals using M&S can help identify cost effective test scenarios and reduce risk of failure. During conduct of tests, M&S might provide adequate surrogates to provide stimulation when it is too impractical or too costly to use real world assets. This impracticality is particularly likely for capability testing or testing a system that is part of a system-of-systems, or for
- hazardous/dangerous tests or in extreme environments, or for testing the system's supportability M&S can be used in post-test analysis to help provide insight, and for interpolation or extrapolation of results to untested conditions

DOT&E TEMP Guidebook

DOT&E TEMP Guidebook - Feb 27, 2012

- M&S for Test Planning, Pretest Predictions, and Evaluation Guidance
 - The Modeling and Simulation (M&S) sections should address how M&S will be employed in the overall test strategy and how the M&S will be verified, validated and accredited (VV&A). Specifically the TEMP should list any M&S expected to be used, the intended use, any data requirements, the test objectives to be addressed and/or how test scenarios will be supplemented with M&S, the planned VV&A effort, and who will conduct the VV&A effort (ref. DoDI 5000.61). The TEMP should list any specific test events required for VV&A of the M&S. The resources for the specific test events will be included in Part IV.
 - M&S is used throughout developmental, operational and live fire testing. M&S can support evaluation of requirements, trade studies, test planning, pre-test predictions, evaluation of system performance, and other uses. It includes a broad set of tools including spreadsheet models, highfidelity digital models, and hardware and computer in the loop facilities.
 - M&S for Test Planning and Prediction
 - M&S is frequently used in test planning and pre-test predictions. If M&S will be used as a basis for decisions regarding test scope test conditions, describe how it will be used. Which tests will have pre-test predictions? Which pre-test predictions will be based on M&S?
 - M&S for Evaluation
 - Another common intended use is that M&S can support the evaluation of system performance. The TEMP should describe how M&S Adoter common intellede use sinait NAS cara support the evaluation of system performance. The "courts" stock describer how the Adoter common intellede uses in that NAS cara support the evaluation of system performance. The "courts" anound execute how the Contract Operational bases. Will NAS be used to supplement interpolate, or existence interpolation evaluation to the testing" Stretge warmance the degree of reliance on MAS. Which evaluation issues will be addressed through MAS? Explain why MAS is being used (e.g., safety restrictions precide testing).

Potential STAT in the Execution Phase







- Increasing complexity of mission systems
- Increasing mission software complexity
- Budget constraints (living with overruns to date)
- Low test-point density ?
- High re-fly rates ?
- Challenge of achieving test-point parallelization
- Challenge of communicating capability attainment along with test-point completion
- Post-test facing ever increasing data quantity
- Verification complexity

T&E Compared to Other Eng Disciplines

 Product life-cycle & engineering disciplines taking advantage of well established computer aided engineering (CAE) methods



T&E Execution Phase Detailed Planning Tools Agi

 Great opportunity in the T&E discipline to reap similar benefits by using CAE-like methods in test-event design, execution & post-flight analysis

Friday Tunto	Anadogon Por TLC	Value.	Allerty	
Selection.	1140	Providence.	Charge is fair in all shades in Solar Roberts	
Kanak-	144	Name Inc.	The second restricted	
land b	Tee	Same in	TT-SAF	
Total IV	been fighter [1] Fields			
F Ban	head	Equilation	÷	344
1	Un (April 1971			-
	Union Talas 11.2 Insure - Millionida Uniones Sile - Millionida Dimensity Union Testa - 2008 2000 Union Union Union 1			
1	Ex Jan Españo Cada "Annalasce" Tatale", apor "Antenio Annalasce Richard"			
	daage die offening page applicaties skonscheide Arthonese sigs an UNU T dater die war is often dater offening die sons dater mage filmen Nachfauer feiningt oor der befan die naar Tome Nachfauer (Dit war mei often die naar Tome Nachfauer (Dit war mei often die Tome Nachfauer (Dit war mei often die Nachfauer (Hanes is on zeiter die).	York press	charth; 6a Ton but sall fail ion	
1	Addiese Torport France' spring or the others page	Printer.	A page and Bacchine Lanced)	1.
1	Equina in Vire Equi batala intere tan una bier di anti-	htatar	4	1
	When YYF' is advected doings for speed page type between domains \$50,000 and the speed to \$100 between the speed based to be speed to \$100 between the speed based to be speed to \$100 bits	hereit	a concessión	1





Traditional methods

- Excel
- PowerPoint
- Word
- Custom MATLAB
- "Planes-on-sticks"
- "Flying wrist watches"

T&E Execution Phase Detailed Planning Tools

 "Planes-on-a-stick" is a common method for detailed mission systems test plan route design



Detailed Test Event Planning Considerations

- Available aircraft & condition of systems
- Readiness of software block version
- Sequencing of subsystem tests for parallelization
 - Modes, targets, emitters, integrated operation, ...
- Choreographing of multiple aircraft tests
 - Aircraft, targets, emitters, operating conditions
- Sequencing to minimize fuel usage and tanker use





Detailed Test Event Planning – closer look



Test Plans



Test-point details

. . .

Requirements Objectives Resources Evaluation Criteria MOPS



Test Cards

12 2 1 1 1 1 1	1010	B
題 (5)		
enter Vi	G Service"	
	111000.000	
Line of the other		=

Test point details



Data Links

Toot	noint	dotaila
rest	point	details



Radar

Test point details



EW

Test point details



Requirements Objectives Resources Evaluation Criteria



Mission Deck Test Cards



Flight Routes

M&S Supplement to Detailed Test Planning & Analysis



How can we:

- Ensure test-point success?
- Fly more test-points per flight?
- Reduce planning cycle time?
- React quickly to evaluate anomalies?
- Capitalize on "white-space" effectively?
- Streamline communications?
- Reduce program test costs?

M&S for Interactive Detailed Test Design

\land agi

Build/import models Characterize system

Performance

models

Combine into system model





the second second second second

Define measures of mission effectiveness Run simulations and evaluate performance



Iterative design & analysis Evaluate mission performance Test Planning







Mission results or status



Which route is "better" ?





Predictive Computation



- Determine values of, and "constraint" satisfaction time periods that meet mission objectives
 - Geometric
 - Proximity
 - Pointing
 - Lighting
 - Line-of-sight atmospheric conditions
 - Inter-object geometry
 - Comm link quality, Jamming values
 - Radar performance measures
 - Terrain vertical profile
 - GPS DOP and Nav accuracy prediction





Virtual Sensors Modeling



What can your systems see?

- Dynamic environment
- Number/type of platforms
- Number/type of sensors
- Target constraints
 - Terrain
 - RCS

Complex detection

- Visual
- IR (GSD)
- RF
- Search/Track Radar
- Synthetic Aperture Radar (SAR)
- GMTI (flexible constraints)

Use the right sensor for the mission



Terrain analysis



AzEl Terrain masking (to range, to altitude)

- Colorize flight paths within view of detection mask





Radar to RCS signature planning







Communications Link Modeling





Horizontal Polarization



Ground Omni



C/N Plot – Horiz & Vert





Vertical Polarization



Payload/Sensors Design





Test Event Route Assessment

Aagi

- Colorized flight paths based on simulated results
 - Inter-visibility conditions
 - Sensor conditions
 - GPS navigation accuracy
 - Proximity conditions
 - Radar performance
 - Comm link conditions
 - Flight performance conditions
 - Fuel remaining



Test Event Route Assessment

Interactive route design

- Fuel remaining
- Aspect angle
- Comm performance
- Telemetry assurance
- Dynamic geometry
- Lighting directionality
- RF directionality
- Safety of flight
- Multi-ship choreographing
- Number of test-points





Demonstration – Interactive Route Design



Route Design / Optimization





Multi-Constraint Prediction





Determination of "multi-constraint" satisfaction times

Increasing Test-point Density per Flight





Post-Flight Analysis



- Quick import of telemetry data
- Colorized routes based on:
 - Various operating parameters
 - Various performance parameters
 - AGI generated analytical parameters
 - Events
- Markers on routes or ground (static and time-based)
- Supplemental composable routes to assess variations on effectiveness
- Analytically derived supplemental visual aides
 - Vectors, angles, range lines, head-up data displays, parameter graphs
- Flight playback (quick forward/reverse scroll)

Post-Flight Analysis





- How do you do this?
- Is it too late for my program to do this?
- How much time does this take?
- How detailed do my models need to be?
- What is the implementation cost?
- Is it worth the effort?

How? - When? - How Hard? - How much? - Why?

- How do you do this?
- Is it too late for my program to do this?
- How much time does this take?
- How detailed do my models need to be?
- What is the implementation cost?
- Is it worth the effort?



Final Report - Model Based Engineering (MBE) Subcommittee - NDIA Systems Engineering Division M&S Committee - 2011



MBE Initiation & Evolution – (When?)







Radar	Commun	ications	EOIR	EW	Software	
Vehicle	Systems	Ground	System	s Em	nitters	
HWIL	Systems In	ntegratio	ns Labs			

MBE Initiation & Evolution – (When?)





Virtual Modeling benefit potential in T&E Timeline – (How Much)



event - Specific test point

geometry depictions and animations

Develop Test Plan	Test-Event Design	Event Rehearsal	Pre-Test Re-Plan	Test Execution	Post-Test Analysis
 Test scenario development Timing of test events Gross system trades Detailed system trades Determine objectives – given & derived Determine essential elements of analysis and MOEs Identification of variables for control and measurement Gross trades of schedule of objectives Design of Experiments 	 Selection of test points for specific objectives Flight plan design to match test point goals Coordination of test resources Multiple aircraft Multiple sensors Air & ground Design & planning of specific test Scheduling Planning & analysis of infrastructural items Telemetry systems Test range radars Comm systems Pre-flight briefing material production – animations, snap shots, event schedules	 Use of pre-flight briefing materials Nominal test scenario run through Scheduling check Coordination of test resources Quick reaction test plan modifications 	 Pre-test adaption to last minutes changes Flexibility to bring up nominal test plan in M&S environment and quickly make changes Airspace changes impact assessment & adaption Wind direction impact assessment & adaption Weather conditions changes impact assessment & adaption Provides a means to allow for changes with low impact to test objectives achievement 	 Test event situational awareness tools Real-time visualization of test event On-board aircraft Local to test range Remote to contractor facility or customer facility or customer facility Monitoring of test points achievement versus nominal plan Quick reaction to real- time changes in actual flight paths versus planned nominal and impact on test points and objectives Real-time re-planning to adapt to changes and to execute secondary objectives and test points Remote real-time SA of test events and 	 Rapid production of "quick-look" Actual flight path -vs- nominal Actual test points achieved comparison to plan Visualization of test geometry history correlated with collected test data M&S supplement to actual test results Use of STEP process approach to validate M&S models as part of the feedback loop within the test series Test point trade space extrapolation Variations of parameters to aid in the design of next test event Post test briefing material production
				participation in real- time re-plans	- Animation of entire test

Virtual Modeling benefit potential in T&E Timeline – (How Much)



Develop Test Plan	Test-Event Design	Event Rehearsal	Pre-Test Re-Plan	Test Execution	Post-Test Analysis
 Test scenario development Timing of test events Gross system trades Detailed system trades Determine objectives – given & derived Determine essential elements of analysis and MOEs Identification of variables for control and measurement Gross trades of schedule of objectives 	 Selection of test points for specific objectives Flight plan design to match test point goals Coordination of test resources Multiple aircraft Multiple sensors Air & ground Design & planning of specific test Scheduling Planning & analysis of infrastructural items Test range radars Comm systems Pre-flight briefing material production – animations, snap shots, event schedules 	 Use of pre-flight briefing materials Nominal test scenario run through Scheduling check Coordination of test resources Quick reaction test plan modifications 	 Pre-test adaption to last minutes changes Flexibility to bring up nominal test plan in M&S environment and quickly make changes Airspace changes impact assessment & adaption Wind direction impact assessment & adaption Weather conditions changes impact assessment & adaption Weather conditions changes impact assessment & adaption Provides a means to allow for changes with low impact to test objectives achievement 	 Test event situational awareness tools Real-time visualization of test event On-board aircraft Local to test range Remote to contractor facility or customer facility Monitoring of test points achievement versus nominal plan Quick reaction to real- time changes in actual flight paths versus planned nominal and impact on test points and objectives Real-time re-planning to adapt to changes and to execute secondary objectives and test points Remote real-time SA of test events and narticination in real- 	 Rapid production of "quick-look" Actual flight path -vs- nominal Actual test points achieved comparison to plan Visualization of test geometry history correlated with collected test data M&S supplement to actual test results Use of STEP process approach to validate M&S models as part of the feedback loop within the test series Test point trade space extrapolation Variations of parameters to aid in the design of next test event Post test briefing material production
				participation in real-	- Animation of entire test

time re-plans

event - Specific test point

geometry depictions and animations

T&E Tool Kit Formulation Example – (How?)

Program Test Requirements

- Air Veh performance description
- Physical 3D model
- sensor attach points
- xmtr and rcvr attach points
- Radar spec's description
- EOIR sensors specs
- Comm antenna's specs
- Comm & sensor operating constraints
- Telemetry descriptions
- Data descriptions
- Sensor operating modes & constraints
- Ground handling comm needs
- Typical flight paths (takeoff to op alt)
- Operating flight paths, and comm needs
- Multi-use of sensors and resource loading
- Active sensor targeting CONOPS
- Operating procedures wrt wind conditions
- Payload & bus loading & constraints
- Imaging modes relative resource loading
- Sensor use rules -vs- flight conditions

M&S Configurations



AMM changes

STK data readers

STK system trades

Custom work-flow UIs: Target scheduling Comm link assessment Test points assessment

Specifically Configured M&S Tool Set for T&E Execution





Shortened Test Cycles – (Why?)





Summary of Proven ROI Potential – (Why?)

Efficiency of Test Force operations

 Reduced time for test-force process elements Test-plan process, test-card development process, post-test process 	\$\$
 Shortened and more effective meetings, pre-flight reviews, etc. 	\$
Effectiveness and efficiency of test flights	
 Improved robustness of test-card designs – validation against test plan objectives 	\$
 Increased number of test-points per flight 	\$\$\$\$\$
 Improved scheduling of refuel operations 	\$\$
 Positive overall test-force flight schedule impact 	ŚŚ
 Enabling the complicated choreographing of four-ship flights 	¢¢¢
Communications within the program and with customer	ŶŶŶ
 Illustration of complex concepts and issues at all stages of the execution T&E lifecyc 	le
 Enable greater collaboration 	\$
 Shortened and more effective meetings, pre-flight reviews, etc. 	ŞŞ
 Positive impact to test-point sign-off activities 	\$\$
Flight safety	
 Rich material enabling added insight to pre-flight briefings 	

Robust treatment of multi-ship flight choreographing and event scheduling

Lockheed Martin Developmental Test & Evaluation **F-35 Flight Testing** - Case Study



- **Problem:** Flight test planning is largely manual, relying on talent and intuition of experienced engineers.
- Solution: Use STK MS&A Environment to improve flight test efficiency, effectiveness and repeatability.

All notional depictions on this slide



Outcome: Proof-of-Concept demonstrated improved flight test plans, designs and analysis for mission systems testing.

Accelerated & optimized test planning, Increased flexibility in test event execution and Faster post-test analysis

Communications Link Modeling - Demo





Horizontal Polarization



Ground Omni



C/N Plot – Horiz & Vert





Vertical Polarization



Optimizing Simulator Time – (Why?)







New Metrics Factored into Test Plan Cost & Schedule Forecast – (Why?)





MBE for T&E Initiation & Evolution





Program "ABC"



MBE for T&E Initiation & Evolution







Re-usable Modeling Elements

Rev 1 – additions - designed based on "Program 1" requirements

- Targets manipulation & visualization -----
- GIS, DAFIF, airspace manipulation & visualization ------
- Mission profile route creation and modification ------
- Target scheduling -----
- Sensor operation planning & optimization ------
- Post-flight test point assessment & visualization ------

Rev 1.2 additions – derived from "Program 2" requirements

- Communications link assessment ------
- Real-time telemetry importer -----
- Real-time test point & objectives assessment ------
- Real-time situational awareness, visualization ------
- Real-time systems performance assessment ------
- Weather & winds assessment & incorporation ------
- Import/export to PFPS & AMPS ------

Rev 1.3 additions – derived from "Program 3" requirements

- Flight termination assessment -----
- Camera geometry assessment & visualization ------
- GPS Nav performance assessment & visualization ------









New Metrics Factored into Test Plan Cost & Schedule Forecast – (Why?)





Support for DOE Test Planning





So how does this help me with my overall test planning?

Test Planning Support





The M&S tools provide an easy way to assess the interrelationship and sensitivities of factors to assist in choosing factor sets and setting up effective DOEs

Process Knowledge Evaluation







- Nimble M&S can be effectively used in test execution
- Methods can usually be applied at any point in the cycle given the significant ROI potential
- Benefits attained with requisite level model fidelity
- COTS tools can enable and accelerate implementation
- New methods and metrics can be applied to improve future programs
- Nimble M&S can feed effective STAT/DOE methods



Example Use Cases

CHLOE Test Planning & Com Link Modeling





Horizontal Polarization



Ground Omni



C/N Plot - Horiz & Vert





Vertical Polarization



Telemetry communications prediction modeling reduced re-flights

NGAS - Airborne Networking



Problem: Build A Realistic Model Of an Airborne Network Through Simulation to Predict Network Performance Over the Flight Regime. Validate AN Models Through Live Fly Results

- **Solution:** Use STK, OPNET and Custom Integration Tools to Build a Robust Network Simulation. Compare Initial Model Results with Model Outputs Driven by Real Flight Data
- **Outcome:** Allowed "Pre-flight" of the Network to Highlight Potential Issues and Supported "Post-flight" Link Performance Analysis After Live Exercise



Risk Reduction Through Physics-based Modeling of the Airborne Network

This invention was made in the performance of a Cooperative Research and Development Agreement with the Department of the Air Force.

Aircraft Communications Testing

Northrop Grumman Integrated Systems



Problem

 Determine antenna coverage and blockage from aircraft keel

Solution

 "As installed" antenna patterns analyzed with multiple flight profiles for coverage



Outcome

 Millions of dollars saved in reduced required flight tests of high value aircraft and reduced schedule risk

"Valid flight testing at your desk"

- Bruce MacDougall, NGC

Naval Strike and Air Warfare Center Improved Training – NSAWC



- Problem: Manually intensive procedures for pre-flight planning and post-flight learning
- Solution: Use STK MSAF for accurate, efficient and visually intuitive learning experience



Outcome: Integrated training mission model that allows instructors to model all aspects of the flight and review outcomes with students using a dynamic 3D environment.

"Cost avoidance for re-flys and mission failure is off the charts" _«

(Retired Naval Aviator)

Missile Flight-test Planning and Analysis

Problem: Constant, high-pressure tasks requiring complex, unique analysis approaches. Clearly communicate results to decision-makers.

STEPAL

- Solution: STK out of the box and custom workflows via STK's open APIs. 3D animations convey complex dynamics.*
- Outcome: Seven years of high customer satisfaction and increased contract support to Missile Defense Agency.

*"Much of STEPAL's work went to the President, essentially unchanged." - LTG Obering, former director MDA

'STK's off-the-shelf capability and flexibility allows STEPAL to successfully execute challenging analysis tasks.'

-Frank Grose, senior space systems analyst, SAIC







SPAWAR - Joint Tactical Radio System (JTRS)

- **Problem:** Customer wants to run parametric analysis studies on a HWIL network simulation for JTRS. The simulation is fed from live tests that measure link budget metrics. Live testing is slow and expensive.
- **Solution:** Use STK to stimulate the network simulation using simulated routes, terrain and 3D buildings. TIREM and Uprop used for high fidelity comms.
- **Outcome:** STK eliminates the need to perform live radio tests and gives the JTRS program the ability to investigate the trade space.

The JTRS program is saving \$20K for each JTRS test and is able to run more tests in less time!







Improved Test Range Operations



- **Problem:** Precisely replicate RF signals as they would appear in nature to support range planning and rehearsal.
- Solution: Drive RF channel simulator using STK Engine.



Outcome: Integrated mission model and accurate wireless communication that allows range operators to model all aspects of range.

HWIL Simulated signals that are indistinguishable from live test events.

\land agi

Aircraft Range Safety – Edwards AFB

- Problem: Had no way to analyze impact of proposed wind turbines on airborne radars, needed quick-turn analysis tool
- Solution: Modeled predicted noise and Doppler shift affects in STK, verified against flight test measurements
- **Outcome:** STK provided analysis model that previously did not exist, Analysis completed in 2 weeks



\$1 Million saved in reduced need for flight tests





JNWC Application (NCOE) EW Test Reconstruction

Early Linkage of Requirements to T&E



Systems engineering approach to T&E

- Incorporate predefined system models
- Discover issues early
- Automated documentation (TEMP)

Inputs

- T&E model developed in CORE
- STK scenario

Results

- Ability to react to pre-flight changes with validated re-plans
- More effective post flight analysis & briefing material





AGI/Legacy Tools Integration



Legacy A/C Performance Modeling & Route Generation



STK geometry and constraints



Legacy plug-in code for sensor performance rules & methods Platform/payload performance prediction





Questions?